

DELEGATED DECISION CHECKLIST AND REPORT

APPLICATION NO.

23/01379/LBC

CASE OFFICER

Catherine Fenghour

DETERMINATION DATE 23.05.2024 **EXT OF TIME** 19.07.2024**Address:** Milnrow Public Library Newhey Road Milnrow OL16 3PS

Proposal: Works to repair and fully re-point spalling and structurally compromised stonework, repairs to the roof, ridges and ventilation turret, repairs to rotten windows and historic leaded glass, dismantling and re-building of structurally compromised oriel window, entrance gable and chimney with associated structural ties and support, refurbishment of rainwater goods, localised internal re-decoration, flashing and re-pointing of copings, repairs to existing asphalt roof and incorporation of new opening casements within existing window frames.

PUBLICITY	Weekly list expired?	Y	Site notice expired?	Y
	Neighbour letters expired?	Y	Press Notice expired?	Y

DELEGATION	Significant departure from local plan?	N	Contrary to national policy?	N
	Applicant a Council Member or officer?	Y	Contrary to previous decision?	N
	Major with 10 or more objections and recommending approval?	N	Called in or Planning Panel objection?	N

COMMENTS	Planning Panel comments received?	n/a
	Neighbour comments received?	N

EIA	Screening opinion completed and saved to Onbase?	n/a
-----	--	-----

CONDITIONS	Pre-commencement conditions proposed?	n/a
	Pre-commencement conditions agreed (or notification period expired)?	n/a

RECOMMENDATION	Grant subject to conditions
----------------	-----------------------------

CHECKED AND SIGNED OFF BY: RG**DATE:** 19 July 2024

SITE

The application relates to Milnrow Carnegie library on New Hey Road in Milnrow. This public library is Grade II listed and was designed by the architects S Butterworth and WH Duncan of Rochdale in 1907 and funded by philanthropist Andrew Carnegie. The building successfully combines a mix of both Arts and Crafts and Art Nouveau styles. The building was constructed in high quality materials with intricate ornamentation and the internal layout retains its original distinctive plan form and detailing. Many original fixtures and fittings remain.

The building is also located within the Butterworth Hall (Municipal Buildings) Conservation Area.

PROPOSAL

The proposal seeks to carry out various repair and refurbishment works to the existing building. These are summarised below:

- Dismantling and rebuilding of a section of the gable wall, including removal of any corroding ties and their replacement with stainless steel ties. Original stone to be reused with indent repairs where needed
- Removal of existing cement mortar and repointing in a lime mortar. Redressing of spalled stone work with indent repairs where required
- Dismantling and reconstruction of the oriel window structure, including removal of ferrous framing and bolts. Stitch repairs and indent repairs to existing stone work
- Repair works to the oriel window, including raising of stone gutter detail by 25mm. Works would entail the installation of a stone indent raising strip and new lead drip.
- Dismantling of chimney top and installation of replacement capping stone to match the original detail
- Repairs to the roof, with replacement of damaged, slipped and missing slates. Lead work to be redressed, repaired and replaced. Repairs to asphalt roof.
- Lifting and re-bedding of copings with new lead detailing
- Refurbishment and replacement of cast iron rainwater goods
- Repair and refurbishment of existing windows. New casement windows to larger meeting room window and reading room
- Repairs to steel ventilation turret
- Repairs to internal decoration, including removal of paint from stone dressings and removal of gypsum plaster from window reveals, with repairs in lime plaster. stone indent repairs where necessary

RELEVANT LEGISLATION & PLANNING POLICY

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

16(2) - In considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority or the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

72(1) and (2) – these sections require special attention to be paid to the desirability of preserving the character or appearance of Conservation Areas.

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

Chapter 15 – Conserving and enhancing the natural environment

Chapter 16 – Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

Places for Everyone (PfE)

JP-G8 – A Net Enhancement of Biodiversity and Geodiversity

JP-P2 – Heritage

Adopted Rochdale Core Strategy (CS):

P2 - Protecting and enhancing character, landscape and heritage

G7 – Increasing the value of biodiversity and geodiversity

Unitary Development Plan (UDP):

No relevant saved policies

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

15/00781/LBC – approved – 2 November 2015

Alterations to first floor doors to create fire door, installation of 2 emergency lights (1 to top of stairs and 1 to bulkhead), an electronic door entry system and the addition of highlighted tape to the nosings of the stone staircase to help the visually impaired. Repairs to door styles in understairs WC

99/D36998 – Withdrawn – 15 May 2001

Erection of 0.7m high railings to existing boundary wall entrance gates and ornamental arch

CONSULTATION RESPONSES

Conservation and Design

N/A (report written by Conservation Officer)

Joint Committee of National Amenity Societies

No response

Highways and Engineering

No objections

Greater Manchester Ecology Unit (GMEU)

Initially advised that as the ecologist and preliminary report had found the building to hold high potential for roosting bats, three presence/absence surveys would be required prior to determination.

Following the carrying out of three presence/absence surveys, GMEU were re-consulted. They advised that as no bats have been found and the building has been found to have negligible potential to support roosting bats, a precautionary method statement will be required. The applicant has provided this document as part of the application and GMEU have confirmed its acceptability.

Historic England

No advice offered in this case

REPRESENTATIONS

None received

ANALYSIS

Heritage Impacts

A survey of the building was carried out in 2022. This identified a number of matters that required urgent attention, such as the displacement of the gable wall, buckling of leaded windows and loose stone work. A raft of emergency works were carried out to prevent further damage and the loss of historic fabric. These included the installation of a temporary steel restraint to the gable wall and the temporary removal of original leaded windows at risk of falling out.

This application follows on from these emergency works, proposing long term repair solutions to the issues identified. Each element is considered below:

Dismantling and rebuilding of a section of the gable wall

As noted above, survey works found the upper portion of the entrance gable to be fully unrestrained, likely as a result of corroding metal cramps and ties. Emergency works, including new helical ties and the installation of a temporary steel structure, were carried out to restrain the gable and prevent future collapse. These are not considered to be a suitable long term solution for the building.

The proposed plans indicate that the gable would be partially dismantled and rebuilt, including the piers, which have also been found to be at risk of collapse, with the stonework repaired where necessary. The stonework is shown to be redressed where necessary, with indent repairs proposed only where there are no other feasible options. As part of the works corroded ties will be replaced with stainless steel ties.

A full method statement for the works will be required by condition. In addition samples of the stone and a specification for the lime based mortar will be required. Subject to appropriate detailing, it is considered that the proposed works would have a positive impact on the significance of the heritage asset, ensuring its long term future and prevent further collapse.

Removal of existing cement mortar and repointing in a lime mortar, and repairs to spalled stone work

The existing building appears to have been constructed using a relatively friable bedded stone. This combined with later repointing using a cementitious mortar have resulted in widespread spalling of stone facings. In addition to being unsightly, this presents the risk of falling material. Without action, the spalling stonework will continue to worsen, increasing the risk of historic fabric being lost.

The proposal seeks to cut out existing cementitious mortar and repoint the gable wall with a lime mortar. Sections of the wall which have spalled are proposed to be cut back and redressed where possible, with indent repairs only proposed where the depth of decay is too great for redressing to be practicable.

As a result of these works, there would be some loss of historic fabric. However, without the proposed works, the decay of stonework is likely to continue, risking the loss of historic fabric. To ensure that the works are carried out sensitively, that loss is minimised, and that the appearance of new stone is appropriate, a method statement, samples of stone and details of the mortar specification will be required by condition.

Dismantling and reconstruction of the Oriel window structure

The surveys found evidence of historic movement, which has led to cracking of the side cill and the displacement of stonework. Previous reinforcement, using ferrous steel angles and resin bolt ties, has corroded and is now splitting the stonework and risking water penetration.

The proposal seeks to dismantle and rebuild the Oriel window structure, to remove the ferrous framing and bolts. A combination of stitch repairs and new stonework are proposed depending on whether or not the stones have a structural role. The proposed leaded lights are proposed to be removed, repaired off-site and re-instated.

There would be some loss of historic fabric as a result of the repairs. However, these repairs would address the window's existing structural concerns and would also prevent its continued deterioration. It is considered that the heritage benefits of repairing this element would outweigh the less than substantial harm resulting from loss of historic fabric.

A method statement for the works, mortar specification and stone samples will be required by condition. A method statement and schedule of repairs for the leaded windows will also be required.

Stone gutter detail works

The existing corbelled stone gutter has a lead lining but this has failed and is insufficient to contain heavy rainfall.

The proposed plans show the roof to be re-slatted in this area and that the detail is reworked with the installation of a stone indent raising strip to the upper face of the corbelled gutter. It is indicated that the visual impact of this would be limited from ground floor level, as it would be concealed by the new lead drip.

The proposal would result in a 25mm increase in the height of the stone gutter detail, which would be partially concealed by the increase in the depth of the lead drip detail. There would be some minor harm from the change to the original detail. However, this would be minimal and is considered to be outweighed by the benefits of ensuring that the gutter is capable of dealing with heavy rainfall to prevent damage to the building's fabric.

Dismantling of chimney top and installation of replacement coping stone

There is some damage to the southeast face of the chimney, including spalling, open joints and cracks. To address this, it is proposed to rebuild the top of the chimney, with the incorporation of a reinforcing mesh and new flashing to resist further

movement. Subject to a condition requiring samples of new materials, it is considered that there would be a neutral impact on significance.

Roof repairs and repairs/replacement of lead work

Localised repair works are proposed to the roof. These include the replacement/reinstatement of slipped and missing slates, repairs to lead flashings and the repair and repainting of the flat asphalt roof.

Subject to a condition requiring samples of new slates and details of the lime mortar specification, it is considered that the repair works would have a positive impact on the significance of the listed building.

Lifting and re-bedding of copings with new lead detailing

The proposal includes the lifting of copings and the instatement of new lead flashing to direct water away from the face of the walls. Subject to appropriate detailing, it is considered that these works would have a positive impact on the listed building.

Refurbishment and replacement of cast iron rainwater goods

The proposal seeks to repair and refurbish the existing rainwater goods. These works will have a positive impact, protecting the building's historic fabric.

Repair and refurbishment of existing windows.

The proposal seeks to repair existing windows, as set out on the window schedule plan. The proposed repairs to the clear glass windows are considered to be acceptable, subject to the details provided.

Further details are required in relation to the repair and reinstatement of the leaded and stained glass windows, including those removed and stored as part of the emergency works. This information will be required by condition.

New casement windows to larger meeting room window and reading room

The proposal has been amended and now proposes to replace the windows within the reading room. These windows are not original and are in poor condition. The submitted schedule indicates that the windows would be fabricated in Douglas Fir but with opening lights. Given that these windows are not original, their replacement is likely to have a neutral impact, subject to appropriate detailing. Large scale details of these windows will be required by condition.

Repairs to steel ventilation turret

The ventilation turret is heavily corroded in places. The proposed repairs to the steel ventilation turret include a new rim and brackets, while retaining the remaining original fabric where possible. The repair details are considered to be acceptable and would prevent the further deterioration of this feature. It would also improve the appearance of this element.

Repairs to internal decoration

Water ingress and impermeable finishes have resulted in some damage to the internal fabric. The proposed works include re-plastering in affected areas and repainting in a breathable mineral paint. Subject to a detailed schedule of repairs and finishes, it is considered that this element of the proposal would have a positive

impact on the significance of the heritage asset, as it would prevent the deterioration of the historic building fabric.

Ecology and Protected Species

A preliminary bat roost assessment was submitted as part of the application. A further three presence/absence surveys have been carried out during the lifetime of the application and no bats were found to be present on the site. These surveys have been reviewed by Greater Manchester Ecology Unit. They have confirmed that no further survey work is required and that a method statement for precautionary measures should be conditioned. This document has been provided and reviewed by GMEU, who are happy for it to be conditioned.

Subject to this, it is considered that the proposed works would comply with NPPF, PfE policy JP-G8, and CS policy G7.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that listed building consent be granted subject to the following conditions:

1. The works must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. This consent relates to the following plans and documents:

- 2215.57.202 – Site Location Plan
- 2215.57.302 P4 – Roof Plan and Proposed Works
- 2215.57.303 P2 – Existing Floor Plans Internal Repair Works
- 2215.57.403 P2 – Existing North West and South West Elevations – Proposed Repair Work
- 2215.57.404 P3 – North East and South East Elevations – Proposed Works
- 2215.57.405 P2 – South West Elevation Repair Works – Enlarged
- 2215.57.406 P2 – Existing Sections A-A to D-D - Proposed Works
- 2215.57.407 P3 – Coping Repair Works
- 2215.57.601 P2 – Proposed Roof Repairs – Details Sheet 1
- 2215.57.602 P2 – Proposed Roof Repairs – Details Sheet 2
- 2215.57.603 P1 – Proposed Roof Repairs – Details Sheet 3
- 2215.57.701 P2 – Repairs to Windows and Glazing
- 2215.57.801 P2 – Existing Sections A-A and C-C
- 2215.57.802 P1 – Existing Construction Detail of the Entrance Gable and Scope of Works
- Design, Access and Impact Statement - November 2023
- Milnrow Library – Repair Works – Architectural Specification Tender Draft
- Milnrow Library – Evening Bat Surveys – June 2024
- Milnrow Library – Methodology in case of encountering bats during the works
- Milnrow Library – Method Statement – Masonry Works

and the works shall be carried out in complete accordance with these drawings and documents hereby approved.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure a satisfactory standard of works and to ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special

architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

3. Prior to any works taking place to dismantle the front gable, a method statement for the dismantling and rebuilding of this feature shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The method statement shall include a photographic record of the existing, as well as covering the methods for dismantling, storage and protection of retained materials, repair and rebuilding works.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

4. If any additional stone repairs are identified during the works, details of the method of repair shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local authority, prior to these repairs taking place.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

5. The chimney repairs shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans and specification. Existing stone and brickwork shall be reused wherever possible, with samples of new bricks and stone, where needed to be provided and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to their use.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

6. Prior to any works taking place to dismantle the oriel window, a method statement shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. This shall include details of the method of dismantling, storage and protection of the oriel window during the works and its reinstatement.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

7. Prior to any works taking place to repair and reinstate the leaded windows, a method statement shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The method statement shall include details of the means of dismantling, protection and storage, repair and reinstatement of the leaded and stained glass windows, including those temporarily removed as part of the emergency works.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

8. Prior to their installation, large scale details of all new timber windows (1:10 or 1:5) shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. These details shall include the set back from the face, sections through the head, jamb and cill and details and details glazing bars and openers;

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

9. Samples of all new stone shall be provided on site for inspection and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to its use.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

10. Existing slates should be reused wherever possible. Any new slates shall match the existing roofing materials precisely in respect of unit dimensions, colour and texture and samples of all new slates shall be provided on site for inspection and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to their use.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

11. Prior to its use, a specification for the lime mortar shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

12. All removal of existing mortar shall take place using hand (non-power tools only) unless in the case of a hard cementitious mortar, removal with non-power tools proves impractical. In this case, mortar removal shall take place in accordance with paragraph 150(1) of the approved specification, and a sample panel shall be made available on site and approved in writing by the local planning authority prior to the use of these tools. The works shall then be carried out in accordance with the agreed sample panel.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

13. The internal repairs and finishes shall be carried out in accordance with the details set out within the approved Architectural Specification Tender Draft, unless otherwise agreed in writing.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

Reason: To ensure that special regard is paid to protecting the special architectural and historic interest and integrity of the building under Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

14. The building works shall be carried out in strict accordance with the approved document 'Milnrow Library 2024 – Methodology in case of encountering bats during the works'

Reason: to ensure that protected species are not harmed during building works

Procedure Statement

Not applicable

Notes for Applicant:

1. Work that will impact on habitats where nesting birds may be present (for example demolition of a building or works to trees and other vegetation including undergrowth like bramble), should not be undertaken in the main bird nesting season (March – August) unless suitable checks for active bird nests have been undertaken.